Expanding Access to College and Career Opportunity: Lessons from the Dual Enrollment Equity Playbook

John Fink & Davis Jenkins
Community College Research Center
Teachers College, Columbia University

Gelsey Mehl & Josh Wyner
College Excellence Program
Aspen Institute
AP and Dual Enrollment/Credit dominate college acceleration opportunities for high school students

Note (from original figure): National enrollment data do not exist for DE and CTE beyond 2010–11.

Source: College Board, 2017, p. 9, Figure 1. (Figure A1 reproduces all data from the original figure.)
2017-18 High School Student Participation in Advanced Placement by School District

Source: CCRC analysis of US Dept. of Education Office for Civil Rights data

View an interactive map: https://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/easyblog/ap-dual-enrollment-access-update.html
2017-18 High School Student Participation in Dual Enrollment by School District

DE-Participation Rate
- Less than 0.1%
- 0.1% to 4.0%
- 4.0% to 11.0%
- 11.0% to 20.3%
- 20.3% or more

View an interactive map: https://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/easyblog/ap-dual-enrollment-access-update.html

Source: CCRC analysis of US Dept. of Education Office for Civil Rights data
Growth of Dual Enrollment 1999-2019

IPEDS Fall Enrollments

Fall Undergraduate Enrollments among Students Aged 17 or Younger

Expansion of Dual Enrollment Concentrated at Community Colleges
Findings on the Effects of HS Dual Enrollment

- Accumulation of descriptive and quasi-experimental evidence for dual enrollment, stronger experimental evidence on effects of ECHS

- WWC Report: Positive effects of taking college courses in HS include stronger HS grades, more HS completion, more college enrollment, more credit accumulation, more degree completion.

- Substantial state and institutional variation in post-HS college outcomes among former DE students (Fink, Jenkins, & Yanagiura, 2017)

- Equitable access to and benefits from dual enrollment? Mixed findings.
US Overall: Black, Native, Hispanic, & Pacific Islander HS Students Underrepresented in Dual Enrollment & AP courses

Source: CCRC analysis of 2017-18 Civil Rights Data Collection data

See state-by-state results: https://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/easyblog/ap-dual-enrollment-access-update.html
Substantial national variation in racial equity gaps in DE participation among US school districts…

…but one in five school districts across the country have closed racial equity gaps in access to dual enrollment courses

Source: CCRC analysis of US Dept. of Education Office for Civil Rights data
What can be learned from high schools and colleges that are more effective in serving students of color through dual enrollment?
Playbook Overview

- Quantitative Research: Analysis of statewide data from FL, OH, and WA to identify high school-community college pairings with above-average participation rates and strong outcomes for historically underrepresented students of color*

- Screening Calls: Phone calls with potential sites identified through quantitative research

- Fieldwork: 9 site visits in FL, OH, and WA to colleges, high schools, and district offices**

* Included Black/African American, Hispanic/Latinx, American Indian, Native Hawaiian, Pacific Islander, and Alaska Native students

** Two visits conducted remotely due to the pandemic
The Dual Enrollment Playbook: A Guide to Equitable Acceleration for Students

Five Principles to Advance Equity in High-Quality Dual Enrollment

**Principle I**
SET A SHARED VISION AND GOALS THAT PRIORITIZE EQUITY

**Principle II**
EXPAND EQUITABLE ACCESS

**Principle III**
CONNECT STUDENTS TO ADVISING AND SUPPORTS THAT ENSURE EQUITABLE OUTCOMES

**Principle IV**
PROVIDE HIGH-QUALITY INSTRUCTION THAT BUILDS STUDENTS’ COMPETENCE AND CONFIDENCE

**Principle V**
ORGANIZE TEAMS AND DEVELOP RELATIONSHIPS TO MAXIMIZE POTENTIAL
Aligning high school career clusters with meta-majors to create on-ramps into advanced workforce credentials for CTE dual credit students at Indian River State College

Get Started on Your Pathway

1. Explore Career Clusters
   Career Clusters are groups of similar occupations and industries. They were developed by the U.S. Department of Education as a way to organize career planning. The sixteen Career Clusters are explained on the pages that follow.
   Once you have identified the Career Clusters that interest you, review the offerings at your high school to determine the Career Pathways Academy to pursue.

2. Enter a Career Pathways Academy
   Career Pathways students benefit from a clear path to their future and are able to meet graduation requirements, earn college credits and industry certifications, and gain valuable knowledge—making them college and career ready before they leave high school.
   To get started in a Career Pathways Academy, high school students should contact the counselor at their school.

3. Advance Your Education and Earnings Potential at IRSC
   Every student who successfully completes a Career Pathways Academy will earn college or clock-hour credit at Indian River State College. Follow these steps:
   1. Contact your high school counselor to enroll in your Career Pathways Academy of interest.
   2. Complete your high school Career Pathways Academy.
   3. Complete all IRSC Admission requirements.
      a. Complete an Application for Admission.
      b. Request your transcripts from your high school, and have them sent to the IRSC Office of Student Records.
      c. Apply for financial aid.
      d. Complete New Student Orientation.
   4. Meet with your IRSC advisor to indicate completion of a Career Pathways Academy.
   5. If courses align with your program objective, credit will be verified and applied to your degree or certificate based on your IRSC Academic Plan/Guided Pathway.
   Your eligibility for Career Pathways credit is valid for 36 months following your high school graduation date.

Career Pathways Academies

Okeechobee County High School

Nursing Assistant Academy
(Completes earn up to 397 Career Pathways clock hours at IRSC, plus up to 12 additional IRSC General Education credits.)

Electrocardiography (EKG) Technician Academy
(Completes earn up to 182 Career Pathways clock hours at IRSC, plus up to 12 additional IRSC General Education credits.)

Okeechobee County High School

IRSC graduates get great jobs! What they say:

“I love caring for critically ill patients and their families in their time of need. I feel honored with the trust my patients place in me to care for them at their most vulnerable time. I also was attracted to the career because of the stability and ability to move anywhere and still be employable.”

— Zytia Messier, B.S.N., R.N.
Cleveland Clinic Martin Health
B.S. Degree in Nursing

See more examples here: https://www.irsc.edu/community/quad-county-career-pathways-consortium.html
## Mapping transfer pathways for DE students at Lorain County Community College

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HS Periods</th>
<th>HS Credit</th>
<th>HS Course</th>
<th>LCCC Course</th>
<th>College Credit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>English II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Geometry or Alg. II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>BIOG 151: General Biology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>CHMY 161: General, Organic &amp; Biochemistry I</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>United States History</td>
<td>HSTR 162: US History</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Humanities/Cultural Diversity</td>
<td>ENGL 266: African American Literature *</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Humanities Elective</td>
<td>HUMS 281: Introduction to American Cinema *</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Personal Finance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 10th Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yr. Total</th>
<th>Credit Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10th Grade</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 11th Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HS Periods</th>
<th>HS Credit</th>
<th>HS Course</th>
<th>LCCC Course</th>
<th>College Credit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>BIOG 151: General Biology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>CHMY 161: General, Organic &amp; Biochemistry I</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>United States History</td>
<td>HSTR 162: US History</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Humanities Elective</td>
<td>ENGL 266: African American Literature *</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Advanced Science</td>
<td>PHYC 150: General Physics I</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Advanced Science</td>
<td>CHMY 171: General Chemistry I</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>College Level Math</td>
<td>MTHM 181: Calculus I</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 12th Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yr. Total</th>
<th>Credit Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12th Grade</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fall Semester</th>
<th>Credit Hours</th>
<th>Spring Semester</th>
<th>Credit Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BIOG 252: Microbiology</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>BGSU required course: BIOL 3510: Evolution</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIOS 3000/4000 elective course must be</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>BGSU required course: BIOL 4400: Molecular Neurobiology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGSU 3000/4000 elective course</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>BGSU 3000/4000 elective course</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester Total</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Cumulative Total</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>122</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Playbook Resources

- Highlights from the Dual Enrollment Playbook: A Guide to Equitable Acceleration for Students
- A Guide to Getting Started for Institutional Leaders
- Tool for Evaluating Equitable Practices at Community Colleges
- Tool for Evaluating Equitable Practices at High Schools

https://highered.aspeninstitute.org/dual-enrollment/
To build back enrollments lost to pandemic, colleges are rethinking dual enrollment to **expand access to high-opportunity postsecondary pathways**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conventional Approach</th>
<th>Pathway-Aligned, Acceleration-for-All Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DE courses made available to students who are already “college-bound”</td>
<td>Active outreach to and support for underrepresented students and families starting in middle school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus is mainly on strengthening students’ academic preparedness for college</td>
<td>Focus also on building motivation for college by helping students explore interests and begin to develop a plan tied to college programs and careers in a field of interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleges and schools mainly emphasize general education courses</td>
<td>Colleges and schools introduce students to high-opportunity postsecondary pathways through program foundation courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on achievement of academic content standards</td>
<td>Focus on helping students become confident college learners through engaging, inclusive, &amp; culturally relevant teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school career technical education focused mainly on immediate post-HS employment</td>
<td>High school career technical education students readily able to apply HS CTE credits toward college degree programs in high-opportunity fields</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To build back enrollments lost to pandemic, colleges are rethinking dual enrollment to **expand access to high-opportunity postsecondary pathways**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conventional Approach</th>
<th>Pathway-Aligned, Acceleration-for-All Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DE courses <em>made available</em> to students who are already “college-bound”</td>
<td>✓ ➜ <strong>Active outreach</strong> to and support for underrepresented students and families starting in middle school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus is mainly on strengthening students’ <em>academic preparedness for college</em></td>
<td>✓ ➜ Focus also on building <em>motivation for college</em> by helping students explore interests and begin to develop a plan tied to college programs and careers in a field of interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleges and schools mainly emphasize <em>general education courses</em></td>
<td>✓ ➜ Colleges and schools introduce students to high-opportunity postsecondary pathways through <em>program foundation courses</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on achievement of <em>academic content standards</em></td>
<td>✓ ➜ Focus on helping students become <em>confident college learners</em> through engaging, inclusive, &amp; culturally-relevant teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school career technical education focused mainly on <em>immediate post-HS employment</em></td>
<td>✓ ➜ High school career technical education students readily able to <em>apply HS CTE credits toward college degree programs</em> in high-opportunity CTE fields</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Placement Test Waived due to Pandemic

• Summer and Fall 2020
  – more students of color encouraged and confident in pursuit of Dual Enrollment Courses without the barrier of a standardized test

Dual Enrollment Rates YTD by Race/Ethnicity - F19 vs. F20 YTD

• Overall: ↓ 6.9% FTE / 2% Headcount
• Black Students: ↑ 12% FTE / 18.8% Headcount!!
Recommendations for State Policy

1. Require/incentivize focus on equity
2. Eliminate access barriers
3. Support HS-college partnerships and pathways
Recommendations for State Policy

1. Envision, require, and incentivize focus on equity

_Ideas for discussion_

➢ Set a statewide target for numbers of students in DE, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, income
➢ Require that schools/colleges equalize access for all students by school type (e.g., Title 1) and by student group (race, ethnicity, income).
➢ Incentivize equal access with bonuses for proportionate DE participation
Recommendations for State Policy

2. **Expand access**, reduce costs for students and families

*Ideas for discussion*

- To determine eligibility, use HS GPAs and other alternatives to placement testing
- Create waivers to eligibility standards, provided programs offer additional supports (e.g., Innovative Program waiver policy from OH)
- Support high schools and colleges with transportation dollars
- Make DE free for (at least) low-income students
- Create a tool for families/students to quantify savings based on number of DE credits completed
Recommendations for State Policy

3. Support college-school partnerships to help high school students get on a path to college/career opportunity

*Ideas for discussion*

- Convene schools and community colleges to
  - Set goals for dual enrollment
  - Develop plan to help every DE student set **program-specific** postsecondary plans
  - Devise systems to achieve common goals
- Mandate that school-college partnerships help all DE students:
  - Develop at least a preliminary college/career **program** plan
  - Fill out the FAFSA before graduating
Thank you!

Access the *Dual Enrollment Playbook* and other resources at

**Aspen:** [https://highered.aspeninstitute.org/dual-enrollment](https://highered.aspeninstitute.org/dual-enrollment)


Or contact us at:

gelsey.mehl@aspeninst.org

john.fink@tc.edu